



**Governing Council
Sixty-sixth Session**

GC/66/22
15 May 2024

15–16 May 2024
Hybrid format

MINUTES OF THE THIRD MEETING
IARC, Lyon and web conference

Thursday, 16 May 2024, at 14:00 Central European Summer Time (CEST)

Chairperson: Professor Norbert IFRAH (France)

Secretary: Dr Elisabete WEIDERPASS, Director, IARC

CONTENTS

	Page
1. Appointment of new members of the Scientific Council (closed session)	5
2. Sustainable financing of IARC – proposal for the creation of a formal working group and its composition (continued)	5
3. Membership of the Subcommittee on the Admission of New Participating States	8
4. Any other business	8
5. Election of Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson for next session	8
6. Date of next session	8
7. Closure of session	9

Participating State Representatives

France

Professor Norbert Ifrah, Chairperson
Monsieur Nicolas Albin, [unable to attend]
Dr Thomas Dubois

Australia

Professor Dorothy Keefe, Vice-Chairperson
Ms Lisa Malloy

Ireland

Mr James Scully, Rapporteur
Dr Joanne Uí Chrualaoich

Austria

Ms Elisabeth Tischelmayer

Belgium

Ms Eloïse Delforge
Ms Anne Swaluë

Brazil

Dr João Paulo de Biaso Viola
Dr Ronaldo Corrêa Ferreira da Silva
Ms Livia de Oliveira Pasqualin

Canada

Dr Emma Ito
Dr Madeleine Bird

China

Dr Yanhong Guo
Professor Jie He
Ms Ying Li
Ms Yawei Zhang
Mr Wenqiang Wei
Mr Wanqing Chen
Mr Jun Du

Denmark

Dr Morten Frisch

Egypt

Professor Mohamad Hassany
Dr Khaled Atallah
Prof. Dr Maha Ibrahim
Prof. Dr Hesham Elghazaly
Dr Hatem Amer

Finland

Ms Tuula Helander

Germany

Ms Marike Kranes

Hungary

Professor Gabriella Liskay

India

No Representative

Iran (Islamic Republic of)

No Representative

Italy

Dr Mauro Biffoni

Japan

Dr Hitoshi Nakagama
Mr Masato Izutsu [remotely]
Dr Kanami Kobayashi
Mr Tomohiro Matsuda
Ms Kay Ohara

Morocco

Dr Latifa Awatef Belakhel
Dr Loubna Abousselham
Dr Youssef Chami Khazraji

Netherlands

Dr Susan Potting
Mr Pieter de Coninck

Norway

Professor Tone Bjørge
Professor Pål Richard Romundstad

Qatar

Dr Al-Hareth M. Al-Khater
Dr Noora Al Hammadi

Republic of Korea

Ms Jinkyoungh Jeong
Mr Yeol Kim
Mr Sunghoo Hong

Russian Federation

Dr Ekaterina Karakulina
Dr Valeriya Gulshina
Mr Anton Minaev
Mr Ivan Tarutin
Dr Anna Shakhzadova
Dr Tigran Gevorkian
Dr Valeriy Breder
Ms Liubov Pashigorova
Ms Elena Iozhits

Saudi Arabia

Professor Mushabbab Al Asiri
Dr Ali Saeed AlZahrani
Professor Samar Alhomoud

Spain

Dr Elena Doménech

Sweden

Professor Jonas Oldgren [unable to attend]

Switzerland

Mr Florian Dolder

**United Kingdom of Great Britain and
Northern Ireland**

Dr Mark Palmer
Dr Isobel Atkin

United States of America

Dr W. Kimryn Rathmell
Ms Sofija Korac
Dr Matt Lim
Dr Satish Gopal
Ms Dalana Johnson
Mr Mark Dagher
Ms Christina Taylor
Dr Maya Levine

World Health Organization

Dr Bente Mikkelsen
Director, Noncommunicable Diseases, WHO headquarters
Ms Holly Moore
Senior Legal Officer, WHO headquarters

Observers

Scientific Council

Dr Manami Inoue, outgoing Chairperson
Dr Luis Felipe Ribeiro Pinto, incoming Chairperson

Union for International Cancer Control (UICC)

Dr Cary Adams, Chief Executive Officer

External Audit

Mr Singh, Director of External Audit (WHO)
Office of the C&AG of India

Secretariat

Dr E. WEIDERPASS, *Secretary*
Ms C. MEHTA

Dr P. BASU
Ms A. BERGER
Dr F. BRAY
Dr P. BRENNAN
Dr A. CARVALHO
Dr V. CHAJES
Mr C. CHAUVET
Dr G. CLIFFORD
Mr O. EXERTIER
Dr P. FERRARI

Dr Z. HERCEG
Dr M. JENAB
Ms J. JONGERIUS
Mr D. KAVANAGH
Ms. A. KIRJASUO
Dr Z. KOZLAKIDIS
Ms N. LAMANDÉ
Dr B. LAUBY-SECRETAN
Ms T. LEE
Dr D. LOKUHETTY
Mr F. LOZANO
Mr S. LUBIATO
Dr F. MADIA

Dr V. McCORMACK
Dr J. McKAY
Ms S. MOLDAN
Ms K. MULLER
Dr S. RINALDI
Dr M. SCHUBAUER-BERIGAN
Dr J. SCHÜZ
Dr C. SCOCCIANI
Dr I. SOERJOMATARAM
Ms V. TERRASSE
Ms V. VOCANSON
Dr J. ZAVADIL

1. APPOINTMENT OF NEW MEMBERS OF THE SCIENTIFIC COUNCIL (closed session): Item 25 of the Agenda ([Document GC/66/19](#))

The Governing Council met in closed session. On the resumption of the public session, the RAPPORTEUR read out the following draft resolution, adopted during the closed session and entitled "Appointment of new members of the Scientific Council" (GC/66/R18):

The Governing Council,
In accordance with the provisions of Article VI of the Statute of the Agency,

1. APPOINTS

Professor Adam Grant Elshaug, Australia)	
Professor Eric Van Cutsem, Belgium)	
Professor Hesham Elghazaly, Egypt)	
Professor Tatsuhiro Shibata, Japan)	to serve for four years
Dr Ali Saeed Al-Zahrani, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia)	on the Scientific Council
Dr María José Sánchez Pérez, Spain)	
Professor Richard Sullivan, United Kingdom)	

2. THANKS the outgoing members of the Scientific Council, Drs Louisa Gordon (Australia), Marc Arbyn (Belgium), Manami Inoue (Japan), Ferrán Catalá (Spain) and Kalipso Chalkidou (United Kingdom) for their valuable work in the Scientific Council and for the contribution which they have made to the research activities of the Agency.

2. SUSTAINABLE FINANCING OF IARC – PROPOSAL FOR THE CREATION OF A FORMAL WORKING GROUP AND ITS COMPOSITION: Item 16 of the Agenda

([Document GC/66/10 Rev.1](#)) (continued)

At the invitation of the CHAIRPERSON, the RAPPORTEUR presented the terms of reference (ToRs) for the Working Group on Sustainable Financing, which had been revised to reflect the amendments submitted by the representative of the United States of America.

The CHAIRPERSON inquired whether the Governing Council wished to make further amendments to the text.

Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) asked that each of the substantive amendments be considered individually in turn.

The RAPPORTEUR drew attention to the first proposal by the United States of America which was to remove the words "Membership may also include" in line 14.

Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) said that the phrase had been considered a legacy phrase which had been present in previous ToRs, but it was not considered to be necessary in the present case.

The RAPPORTEUR drew attention to the second proposal which was to change the introductory phrase: "The WG will" to read "The objectives will be:" and to delete the first two ToRs beginning "Assess the current financial landscape of IARC..." and "Review and analyse past funding models".

Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) said that it was proposed that the paragraph should begin with a reference to the term "objectives" in order to align it with the statement in the opening paragraph: "These ToRs outline the objectives, scope, composition..." and then to recall the responsibilities of the

Agency in achieving its objectives. There was further a wish to emphasize the role of the Working Group in reviewing the investment case as opposed to the role of the Secretariat in reviewing and drafting: the two bullet points on assessing the financial landscape and reviewing and analysing past funding models which had been deleted from the present section would therefore appear in the section entitled “Responsibilities”.

The CHAIRPERSON sought the views of the Governing Council on the amendments reviewed thus far. He noted that there were no objections to removing the words: “Membership may also include”. In the absence of any further comments or objections, he took it that the Governing Council accepted the replacement of the words “The WG will” by “The objectives will be”. The first two ToRs would be removed and inserted at the beginning of the section under “Responsibilities”.

The RAPPORTEUR drew attention to the suggestion to modify the beginning of the second bullet point which had originally read: “Define an investment case for IARC...” to read: “Consider a Secretariat-developed investment case for IARC...” and to insert a new (third) bullet point that would read: “Provide recommendations on Participating State and Secretariat actions that could augment existing annual contributions to the Governing Council Session in May 2025”.

Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) said that the purpose of the suggestion to refer to a “Secretariat-developed investment case” was to emphasize the role of the Secretariat in developing and drafting it.

Dr PALMER (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) said that the phrase to “Consider a Secretariat-developed investment case” was an action, but he was not sure that it could be described as an objective.

Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) agreed with the remark by the representative of the United Kingdom and suggested that the bullet point beginning “Consider...” should be moved to the section under “Responsibilities”. He explained that the purpose of the additional bullet point beginning “Provide recommendations...” had been to emphasize that the working group would be producing proposals beyond those relating to annual contributions.

Ms MEHTA (Director of Administration and Finance, ad interim) said that the additional bullet point might also be considered to be an action point. Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) agreed with that suggestion since the action points would lead to recommendations.

Mr DOLDER (Switzerland) asked whether the recommendations would be focused on the annual contributions and whether the Working Group would make recommendations on how to increase the annual contributions.

Ms MEHTA (Director of Administration and Finance, ad interim) said she believed that, rather than working on augmenting annual contributions, the purpose was to examine other financing options.

Mr DOLDER (Switzerland) said that was also his understanding, but he was not convinced that it was reflected in the language set out in the ToRs.

Ms MEHTA (Director of Administration and Finance, ad interim) suggested that the objective could be defined as “To work on augmenting annual contributions and other forms of financing for IARC”.

The VICE-CHAIRPERSON, speaking in her capacity as the representative of Australia, said that she was concerned that it would be premature and indeed impossible for a committee of some 30 people to define the ToRs for a Working Group that had not yet been endorsed. She suggested that the Governing Council should focus on the draft resolution under which the Working Group would be established and then give the Secretariat and the Working Group the instruction to write the ToRs of the Working Group on sustainable financing of IARC.

The CHAIRPERSON said that there were two possible courses of action before the Governing Council: to proceed to consider the draft resolution as suggested by the Vice-Chairperson; or to continue to

re-draft the ToRs which had been initially set out in [Document GC/66/10 Rev.1](#). If the former course of action were chosen, the comments and suggestions made during the present meeting could be taken into account by the Secretariat and the Working Group.

Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) said that the amendments he had put forward had been prompted by the presentation of the ToRs in [Document GC/66/10 Rev.1](#) on which the United States did not agree. If it were the will of the Governing Council to proceed as discussed, then he would be prepared to abandon the current editing exercise.

The CHAIRPERSON said that the most pragmatic suggestion was perhaps to proceed as suggested by the Vice-Chairperson on the understanding that all of the remarks on the ToRs made by the Governing Council would be taken into account at the drafting stage. He sought the views of Governing Council members.

The VICE-CHAIRPERSON requested that the Governing Council should first consider and adopt the relevant draft resolution.

The RAPPORTEUR said that the number of Governing Council representatives on the Working Group remained to be confirmed.

The CHAIRPERSON noted the request from the representative of Italy to join the list of representatives from Canada, the Russian Federation and the United States of America who had already put their names forward.

Mr TARUTIN (Russian Federation) asked for confirmation that, from a legal standpoint, the Governing Council was not obliged to agree the ToRs at the present meeting and that the task could be entrusted to the Working Group.

Ms MOORE (Senior Legal Officer, WHO) said that it was often the practice for the Governing Council to establish the ToRs, but the Statutes did not explicitly state that it should be the case. She would defer to established practice at IARC and she understood that working groups had often been established in the past without having their ToRs agreed at the outset. A reference to agreement on future ToRs could be added to the draft resolution if the Governing Council so decided.

The CHAIRPERSON noted that in the absence of any further comments, the Governing Council wished to consider the draft resolution as drafted.

The RAPPORTEUR read out the following draft resolution, entitled “Working Group on Sustainable Financing of IARC” (GC/66/R10):

The Governing Council,

Having reviewed [Document GC/66/10](#) “Working Group on sustainable financing of IARC – Proposal for the creation of a formal working group and its membership”,

1. ESTABLISHES a Working Group on sustainable financing of IARC, composed of four members of the Governing Council and a representative from the World Health Organization, and supported by such members of the Secretariat as are designated by the IARC Director;
2. NOMINATES the Governing Council representatives from Canada, Italy, the Russian Federation and the United States of America, to be part of the Working Group; and
3. REQUESTS the Director to report back to the Governing Council at its 67th Session in May 2025 on the recommendations of the Working Group.

The resolution was **adopted**.

**3. MEMBERSHIP OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE ON THE ADMISSION OF NEW PARTICIPATING STATES:
Item 26 of the Agenda**

The CHAIRPERSON asked for volunteers to serve on the Subcommittee. He recalled that the current membership of the Subcommittee comprised Brazil, Japan, Qatar, the United Kingdom and the United States of America, in addition to the Chairperson of the Governing Council as an ex officio member.

Professor HASSANY (Egypt) volunteered to join the Subcommittee.

The RAPPORTEUR read out the following draft resolution, entitled “membership of the Subcommittee on the admission of new Participating States” (GC/66/R19):

The Governing Council,
Recalling its Resolution GC/18/R14 nominating members of the Subcommittee on the Admission of new Participating States and the requirement to nominate new members at the end of each session of the Governing Council,
Recalling its Resolution GC/53/R20 deciding that the number of members and composition of the Subcommittee shall be agreed upon at each regular session of the Governing Council,
DECIDES that this Subcommittee shall be composed of the Chairperson of the Governing Council (member ex officio), and representatives of Brazil, Egypt, Japan, Qatar, the United Kingdom and the United States of America, who shall hold office until the next regular session of the Council.

The resolution was **adopted**.

4. ANY OTHER BUSINESS: Item 27 of the Agenda

The CHAIRPERSON informed the Governing Council that there was no other business brought to his attention nor to the Secretariat's.

Professor KEEFE (Vice-Chairperson) took the Chair.

5. ELECTION OF CHAIRPERSON AND VICE-CHAIRPERSON FOR NEXT SESSION: Item 28 of the Agenda

Professor KEEFE (Australia), speaking as the representative of Australia, nominated Professor Ifrah (France) for re-election as Chairperson of the Governing Council, the nomination being seconded by Mr SCULLY (Ireland), speaking as the representative of Ireland.

Professor Ifrah resumed the Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON thanked the Governing Council for the renewed trust they had placed in him. He invited nominations for the post of Vice-Chairperson.

On the proposal of Dr PALMER (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland), Professor Dorothy Keefe (Australia) was re-elected as Vice-Chairperson, the proposal being seconded by Dr ITO (Canada).

6. DATE OF NEXT SESSION: Item 29 of the Agenda

The RAPPORTEUR read out the following draft resolution, entitled: “Date of the Sixty-seventh session of the Governing Council” (GC/66/R20):

The Governing Council,

1. DECIDES to hold its next regular session in Lyon, France, within the two weeks preceding the opening of the World Health Assembly in the year 2025; and
2. REQUESTS the Director to inform members of the Governing Council as soon as these dates are known.

The resolution was **adopted**.

Mr DAGHIR (United States of America) obtained the authorization from the CHAIRPERSON to deliver a statement.

He expressed his country's appreciation of the plans to update the Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for relations between IARC and WHO, particularly in respect of assessments under the Monographs programme, and asked to be kept updated on the progress of the update and to be made aware of the WHO official responsible since the appointment of the new WHO Deputy Director-General. In particular, his country wished to ensure the avoidance of overlap and duplication and the careful coordination of public communication about IARC Monographs hazard identifications and reviews of food products under the Codex Alimentarius and its subsidiary bodies, including the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives and the Codex Committee on Pesticide Residues. If an IARC review, which assessed the hazards associated with a substance, and a Codex review, dealing with the risks associated with the same substance, took place at the same time, using different methodology and produced different results, this could become a potential source of confusion and loss of credibility. Future versions of the SOP should take into account the principle reflected in the report of the eighty-fifth session of the Executive Committee of the Codex Alimentarius Commission, that double evaluations by IARC and Codex committees should be limited to circumstances in which non-dietary exposure was noteworthy, and that scientific and communications activities should be coordinated as appropriate.

The CHAIRPERSON acknowledged the concerns of the United States of America and other Participating States. The IARC Secretariat and WHO were working together to ensure the scientific rigour of risk assessments and communicate a consistent message to the public.

The SECRETARY undertook to send a detailed written response on the issue to the Government of the United States. The appointment of a WHO official to supervise the amendments to the SOP was a matter for the WHO Director-General.

Dr SCHUBAUER-BERIGAN, Acting Head, Evidence Synthesis and Classification, clarified that the hazard assessment by the IARC Monographs do not replicate or duplicate the risk assessment conducted by WHO.

7. CLOSURE OF SESSION

The SECRETARY expressed her deep appreciation for the dedicated participation, engagement and contribution of the Participating States, and again welcomed Egypt and Saudi Arabia to their number. IARC's mission had never been more vital than it was today, particularly for low- and middle-income countries and underserved populations. She commended all her staff on their excellent work and paid particular tribute to the staff involved in the organization of the session, as well as the Chairperson of the Scientific Council and WHO colleagues.

After the customary exchange of courtesies, the CHAIRPERSON declared the session closed.

The meeting rose at 15:30.